



ARMENIAN IMMIGRATION TO THE SEBASTIA REGION, TENTH-ELEVENTH CENTURIES

S. Peter Cowe

Periodization of Armenian Immigration

The two centuries under review are pivotal for an understanding of the Armenian Middle Ages, marking as they do the zenith of the renewed Armenian kingdom under the Bagratuni/Bagratid dynasty in the tenth, its gradual demise in the first half of the eleventh century, and the subsequent transition via a Sebastia-Cappadocia interlude toward the establishment of another state to the south of the historic Armenian lands, in Cilicia, where the final Armenian monarchy was inaugurated at the end of the twelfth century.¹ The first traces of the Armenian polity's expansion into the Sebastia region date from the accession of Ashot I Bagratuni in 884/85, during a period of Byzantine ascendancy and a weakening of the central power of the caliphate. The second period of immigration into that area tabulates the decline of the various emergent Armenian states and the collapse of the Byzantine administrative structures that succeeded them. This occurred in the path of Seljuk Turks, who were driven westward by a population explosion in Central Asia.² The significant relocation of many scions of the two most important Armenian princely and royal houses, the Artsruni and Bagratuni, in the course of the eleventh century and their settlement in the

¹ For the precise dating, see Sirarpie Der Nersessian, "The Kingdom of Cilician Armenia," in *A History of the Crusades*, Kenneth M. Setton, ed., vol. 2 (Milwaukee: University of Wisconsin Press, 1969), p. 648n23.

² For a detailed study of the subject, see Gérard Dédéyan, "L'immigration arménienne en Cappadoce au XI^e siècle," *Byzantion* 45:1 (1975): 41-117.

eastern and western regions of Cappadocia, respectively, marks yet another upheaval in the traditional semi-feudal *nakhharar* system, for long the backbone of the Armenian social structure, with important implications for the redefinition of Armenian identity in subsequent centuries.³ At the same time, the resettlement in Sebastia-Cappadocia offered a certain period of consolidation, leading to the creation of a new state around the nucleus of the Rubenian/Rubenid holdings at Baka (Vahka) in the Anti-Taurus Mountain range, which in due course developed into the Cilician kingdom.⁴

The West Syrian Model of Immigration

It is important to explore the circumstances behind the successive emigrations of a substantial Armenian population into the Sebastia region, starting in the late ninth century, and what the pattern of Armeno-Byzantine interaction reveals about Byzantine eastern policy at this time. The thesis is that a parallel approach of integrating first the Syrians, then the Armenians, into the Byzantine mainstream was attempted in the different parts of Cappadocia as a means of regularizing and homogenizing this strategic territory in order to tie it more closely to the center and reduce the effect of centrifugal forces among the recent immigrants. In both cases, local ethnic and religious quarrels undermined the effective

³ See the classic treatment of N[ikoghayos] Adontz, *Armenia v epokhu Iustiniana* (St. Petersburg: Akademiia Nauk, 1908), trans. and comm. Nina G. Garsoïan, *Armenia in the Period of Justinian* (Lisbon: Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, 1970).

⁴ For Baka, see Friedrich Hild and Hansgerd Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien* (Tabula Imperii Byzantini 5:1) (Vienna: Austrian Academy of Sciences, 1990), pp. 207-08. According to Rubenian propaganda, the originator of the dynasty was a relative of the last king of Ani, Gagik II, for which see Vahram Rabuni, "Otanawor patmutiun Rubeneats" [Verse History of the Rubenians], in *Receuil des historiens des croisades: Documents arméniens*, Edouard Dulaurier, ed., vol. 1 (Paris: Académie des inscriptions et belles-lettres, 1869), p. 491. Other sources portray Ruben as a member of Gagik's court. See Smbat Sparapet, *Taregirk* [Annals], ed. Samuel Agelian (Venice: Mekhitarist Press, 1956), pp. 101-02. A third variant argues that the Rubenians are of Artsruni descent. See Kirakos Gandzaketsi, *Patmutiun Hayots* [History of Armenia], ed. Karen A. Melik-Ohanjanian (Erevan: Armenian Academy of Sciences, 1961), p. 109.

implementation of this policy.⁵

The Syrian model associated with Melitene (Malatia), metropolis of the region known as Second Armenia since the early fifth century, may be considered first. As in the case of the later pattern of Armenian immigration, this process involved three distinct phases: first encouraging settlement, then advocating the relocation of the seat of power, which in the Syrian instance relates to their patriarchate, and finally neutralizing the seat of power and integrating the community into the majority population.

Attacked by the Arabs in 635 and taken in 656, eastern Cappadocia was finally integrated into their expanding empire and remained under Arab control during the years 757-934, functioning as a buffer zone between the Arab and Byzantine spheres of influence. West Syrians (Jacobites) resided there under Arab domination, Melitene being the seat of a bishop since 793.⁶ Once recaptured for the Byzantines by the commander John Kourkouas (Gurgen) under the emperor Romanos I Lekapenos with the assistance of Armenian troops, the Arabs were compelled to leave the region, which then came under the supervision of the *dux Mesopotamiae*.⁷ Because there was a dearth of Chalcedonian Orthodox to repopulate the area, more Syrians were encouraged to settle there, ultimately giving rise to a West Syrian metropolis at Tzamandos during the years 954-57 and the construction of the Monastery of Sergius and Bacchus in the region of Kludia in 958.⁸

This influx was followed by a second wave of immigration

⁵ See Gilbert Dagron, "Minorités ethniques et religieuses dans l'Orient byzantin la fin du X^e et au XI^e siècle: L'immigration syrienne," *Travaux et Mémoires* 6 (1976): 188. For the contemporary Byzantine application of this policy in other parts of the empire with similar results, see Aleksandr P. Kazhdan and Ann W. Epstein, *Change in Byzantine Culture in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1985), p. 172.

⁶ Friedrich Hild and Marcell Restle, *Kappadokien* (Tabula Imperii Byzantini 2) (Vienna: Austrian Academy of Sciences, 1981), p. 117. For a convenient map of the West Syrian bishoprics in the seventh and eighth centuries, see Wolfgang Hage, *Die syrisch-jakobitische Kirche in frühislamischer Zeit* (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1966), inside back cover.

⁷ Mesopotamia was established by Leo VI as a theme on Armenian lands east of the Euphrates River. See Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 85.

⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 91, 117.

of Syrians to Melitene in 965 during the time of Nikephoros Phokas (Nicephorus Phocas), who entered into an agreement with the West Syrian Patriarch John VII Sarigta (965-85) to ensure his flock religious freedom.⁹ As there was no possibility of the West Syrian Patriarch returning to his titular see of Antioch, since when the Byzantines gained control of the city in 969 they installed a Chalcedonian Patriarch, the Syrian Patriarch acquiesced to move out of Arab territory and take up residence in the new Barid monastery in the Anti-Taurus, which remained the patriarchal seat until 1029.¹⁰ This in turn led to a series of West Syrian constructions in southeast Cappadocia and the establishment of new sees, sometimes paralleling Byzantine ones, as at Arabissos and Arka.¹¹ Moreover, since many of the Syrian settlers were rich and educated, their taking up residence caused an economic upswing.¹² The movement also contributed to a renewal of Syriac literature in the area over the next few centuries, which now enjoyed direct contact with Greek works for the last time.¹³

Chalcedonian reaction to these events was swift. Phokas summoned the Syrian Patriarch to Constantinople for discussions in circa 966, and he was detained there until Nikephoros' successor, John Tzimiskes, released him in 969.¹⁴ This was followed by a Chalcedonian attempt to subvert the election of the West Syrian Patriarch in 1003. At that point Jacob bar Mar Ivannus of Melitene

⁹ Ibid., p. 118; Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 187.

¹⁰ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, pp. 92, 118.

¹¹ Ibid., p. 118. For the range of sees and monasteries established in the area, see Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," pp. 188-89.

¹² Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 118; Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," pp. 193-96. The region of Melitene formed a Christian bulwark during the eleventh century, being one of the last eastern Anatolian cities to fall (1102) under Seljuk control. See Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 86; Andrew Palmer, "Charting Undercurrents in the History of the West-Syrian People: The Resettlement of Byzantine Melitene after 934," *Oriens Christianus* 70 (1986): 37-68.

¹³ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 119; Palmer, "Undercurrents," pp. 53-56, 64-65. For details, see Andrew Palmer, "The Renewal of the Art of Calligraphy in Melitene and Tur Abdin c.1000," *Qolo Suryoyo* 42 (1985): 26-29, where the author discusses innovations in Syriac script and the reintroduction of manuscript illumination, speculating that the latter may have been assisted through contacts with the Armenian community. For Syriac manuscripts extant from the region, see Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 197.

¹⁴ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 118.

was seized and deported to Constantinople.¹⁵ Subsequently, in 1028 the Chalcedonian metropolitan of Melitene again brought charges against the West Syrians.¹⁶ In the following year, he requested that their patriarch, John VIII (Yohannan bar Abdun), be taken from the Barid monastery to Constantinople with six bishops for ecclesiastical trial on a charge of proselytism.¹⁷ There, three of the six bishops submitted to the Chalcedonian creed, whereas the bishop of Tzamandos was stoned to death and the patriarch excommunicated and banished to a monastery on Mount Ganos in Thrace, where he died in 1033.¹⁸ The result was that the Syrians pulled back to the hill country of Qlaudia. The following year in the village of Tamanin they elected a new patriarch, Dionysius IV (1034-44), who retired for protection to Arab territory in Amida after a warrant had been issued for his arrest by the dux of Antioch, thus thwarting efforts at a forced ecclesiastical union.¹⁹ In 1063, the final Chalcedonian persecution of the West Syrians took place. Thereafter, the number of Byzantine sees in the area began to decline, whereas the West Syrians continued to thrive into Mongol times.²⁰

The First Phase of Armenian Immigration

In contrast to the Syrian model, the process of Armenian im-

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ This appears the most plausible context for Demetrios of Cyzicus's tract on the errors of the Syrians (*Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 127, cols. 879-85). See Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 201.

¹⁷ Ibid., pp. 202-03.

¹⁸ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 119. In 1064, Ganos also became the place of exile for the Syrian bishop of Melitene until his release under Romanos Diogenes. See Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 204.

¹⁹ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 119. For similar forceful attempts to compel West Syrian adherence to the Chalcedonian creed on the part of the Byzantine Patriarch of Antioch at this time, see Jean-Marie Mayeur et al., *Histoire du Christianisme*, vol. 4 (Paris: Desclée, 1993), p. 418.

²⁰ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 120. From the end of the eleventh century until 1293, the West Syrian patriarchal seat lay in the Monastery of Mar Barsauma southeast of Melitene, about which see Ernest Honnigmann, *Le couvent de Barsauma et le patriarcat jacobite d'Antioche et de Syrie* (CSCO 146) (Leuven: Peeters, 1954). For its relation to the other West Syrian sees of the time, see the map in Mayeur, *Histoire du Christianisme*, vol. 4, p. 441.

migration with Byzantine encouragement into the region of Sebastia, the old metropolis of First Armenia, was much more complex.²¹ Sebastia had been captured from the Byzantines by Muhammad ibn Marwan, who won an important victory over Justinian II (685-95, 705-11) in the environs soon after.²² It was recaptured by Basil I in his campaigns in eastern Cappadocia, northern Syria, and western Armenia from 867 to 886.²³ Whereas Cappadocia in the west saw an increase of Orthodox faithful, with a metropolitan in Caesarea and suffragans in Tzamandos and other places, this development was not replicated in eastern Cappadocia, which had been inhabited by Paulicians under the Arabs and was then laid waste as a no man's land between the Byzantine and Arab spheres of influence.²⁴ Later, under Leo VI (886-912), the region of Sebastia became a *kleisura* (sub-unit within a theme which possessed a certain local autonomy) as the number of Armenian colonists grew, and in 911 it rose to the status of a theme (administrative unit governed by a *strategos* with military and civil jurisdiction).²⁵

A second wave of Armenian settlement began in 963 when Nikephoros Phokas was proclaimed emperor by his troops.²⁶ An extremely able commander, Nikephoros two years later defeated the emir of Tarsus, the last major obstacle for the Byzantines en route to Antioch. This had the effect of pushing the frontier eastward, so that Cappadocia was no longer a border province and thus entered approximately a century of peace and security (circa 965-1065).²⁷ So vast was the immigration of Armenians into the Theme of Sebasteia that they predominated in the population and maintained their own church affiliation, with Armenian bishops being located at Chonion (Honi) and Taranta. Moreover,

²¹ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 274. This full-scale immigration should be distinguished from Armenian military colonies in border regions and merchant colonies in Byzantine entrepôts such as Antioch. See Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 209.

²² Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 274.

²³ Ibid., p. 90.

²⁴ Ibid., p. 117.

²⁵ Ibid., pp. 85, 274.

²⁶ Ibid., p. 274.

²⁷ Ibid., p. 91.

a list of Armenian nobility of 967 refers to the Sebastiank dynasty of Sebastia.²⁸

Finally, the early eleventh-century historian Asoghik states that an Armenian bishopric was created in Sebastia in 986 under Catholicos Khachik I Arsharuni (973-92).²⁹ The tenth-century historian Ukhtanes, a pupil of the eminent scholar and spiritual writer Anania, first abbot of the important Monastery of Narek, seems to have been directly involved in the process of its establishment.³⁰ In the introduction to his *History*, Ukhtanes refers to a discussion about the work's contents and focus, which the two men had at the catholicos' residence in Argina, near the capital of Ani.³¹ He had wished Anania to undertake the task, as he had already produced a refutation of the Christological definition of the Council of Chalcedon and other disputed issues at the catholicos' request.³² Ukhtanes' treatise includes a historical section relating to the Georgian schism from the Armenian Church over the Chalcedonian question at the beginning of the eleventh century, a topic to which he devotes the second book of his tripartite history.³³

The final book, which unfortunately has not come down to us, dealt with the contemporary state of Armeno-Byzantine relations and would have provided valuable information concerning the level of theological debate in which Ukhtanes himself was

²⁸ Adontz, *Armenia in the Period of Justinian*, p. 201.

²⁹ See Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 274n5, and, for the development of other Armenian sees in the region, p. 177.

³⁰ On the monastery and the important academy which developed there in the tenth century, see Hrachya H. Tamrazian, *Narek'yan d'protse* [The School of Narek] (Erevan: Hayastan, 1999), and, for the pivotal role of its first abbot, see H.H. Tamrazian, *Anania Narekatsi: Kyanke ev matenagrutyune* [Anania Narekatsi: Life and Bibliography] (Erevan: Armenian Academy of Sciences, 1986).

³¹ See Bishop Ukhtanes of Sebastia, *History of Armenia*, Part 1. *History of the Patriarchs and Kings of Armenia*, trans. Zaven Arzoumanian (Fort Lauderdale, FL: Zaven Arzoumanian, 1988), pp. 11-20. For a biographical sketch of Ukhtanes, see the chapter by Souren E. Kolanjian in this volume.

³² For a discussion of this work, see Tamrazian, *Anania Narekatsi*, pp. 117-76.

³³ For an examination of Ukhtanes' representation of events at this crucial watershed in Armenian ecclesiastical history, see Jean-Pierre Mahé, "La rupture arméno-géorgienne au début du VII^e siècle et les réécritures historiographiques des IX^e-XI^e siècles," in *Il Caucaso: Cerniera fra Culture dal Mediterraneo alla Persia (Secoli IV-XI)* (Spoleto: Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, 1996), pp. 927-62.

involved. One aspect of this interchange was the attempt of the Byzantines to have Armenians re-baptized, as their sacraments were deemed invalid because of the perception that they adhered to the Monophysite heresy.³⁴ This tension in part resulted from the gradual eastward spread of Byzantine Orthodox population into the region, with the accompanying growth of bishoprics by the end of the tenth century.³⁵ The Byzantine metropolitan of Sebastia compelled the Armenian bishops of Sebastia and Larissa to accept the Chalcedonian creed and sent a polemical tract in a similar vein to Catholicos Khachik in about 986. Around the same time, another communication arrived from Theodore, the Byzantine metropolitan of Melitene, to which the learned vardapet Samvel, abbot of the Monastery of Kamrjadzor in the region of Arsharunik, composed a response.³⁶ The Byzantine persecution of Armenians in the area was only halted by Basil II in 1000, who again permitted them to call the faithful to worship by means of the *kochnak* (semantron).³⁷ At the same time, the expansion of the Armenian Church in Byzantine territory can be gauged by the representation of bishops from those sees at the election of Catholicos Sargis I Sevantsi in 992.³⁸

³⁴ See Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 211, for the attempt by Emperor Constantine IX Monomachos to re-baptize the Armenian nobility on Byzantine soil.

³⁵ For the establishment of Byzantine Chalcedonian dioceses on Armenian territory, see Hrac [Hratch] M. Bart'ikian, "The Religious Diplomacy of Byzantium in Armenia during the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries," in *Armenian Studies: In Memoriam Haïg Berbérian*, ed. Dickran Kouymjian (Lisbon: Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, 1986), p. 59.

³⁶ For the replies of Catholicos Khachik and Samvel Kamrjadzoretsi, see *Girk tghtots* [Book of Letters] (Tiflis: Rotiniants Press, 1901), pp. 302-22. See also the revised edition by Norayr Pogharian (Jerusalem: St. James Press, 1994), for the reply to Melitene, pp. 550-79, and to Sebastia, pp. 580-616. For the historical background, see Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun* [History] (Jerusalem: St. James Press, 1869), p. 47; Ara E. Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades Tenth to Twelfth Centuries: The Chronicle of Matthew of Edessa* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1993), p. 39; Andreas Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun akanavor kaghakin Sebastioy ev sahmans nora* [History of the Illustrious City of Sebastia and Its Environs] (Venice: Mekhitarist Press, 1911), p. 135.

³⁷ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 274; Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 136.

³⁸ Stepanos Taronetsi (Asoghik), *Patmutiun tiezerakan* [Universal History], ed. Stepan Malkhasian (St. Petersburg: I.N. Skorokhodov Press, 1885), pp. 258-59.

The Second Phase of Armenian Immigration

The second phase in the process of Armenian immigration to Sebastia may be said to begin with Basil II's acquisition in 1000 of the lands of Davit, Curopalates of Tao/Tayk, who had bequeathed his territory to the empire, setting an important precedent.³⁹ Thus, when Davit, the son of Senekerim-Hovhannes Artsruni, King of Vaspurakan, met with defeat against Turkish forces in 1016, he went to Constantinople and applied for Byzantine assistance at the price of his inheritance.⁴⁰ According to the agreement, in 1019 Prince Davit-Senekerim became the governing *strategos* of the Theme of Cappadocia, holding the areas of Sebastia, Larissa, Abara (Amarra), Tephrike (Divrig, former center of the Paulicians), Arabkir, and Tokat.⁴¹ This paved the way for his father to cede his realm to Basil II and accept various estates in the region with the rank of *magistros*.⁴² Consequently, in what the historian Matteos Urhayetsi relates was a smooth and peaceful settlement, the Artsruni house moved to Sebastia in 1022-23.⁴³ The later historian Hovhannes Sebastatsi mentions the move included relocating the relic of the Holy Cross kept at Varagavank, which, according to early tradition, had been brought to Armenia from Rome by the virgin martyrs Saints Hripsime and Gayane.⁴⁴ With Senekerim and his four sons came

³⁹ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 95.

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ Ibid., pp. 95, 274. On the Paulician community in the region, see Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, pp. 106-20; Seda B. Dadoyan, *The Fatimid Armenians* (Leiden: Brill, 1997), pp. 49-53.

⁴² Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, p. 111; Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, pp. 71-72. A later source enumerates the property Senekerim left Basil as follows: 4,000 villages, 72 castles, and 10 cities. It also indicates that when the king relocated he brought with him about one-third of the population of his realm. See Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy* [History of Sebastia], ed. Babgen L. Chugaszyan (Erevan: Armenian Academy of Sciences, 1974), p. 32.

⁴³ Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, p. 45.

⁴⁴ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 29. Senekerim and more particularly his wife Khushush, daughter of Gagik I Bagratuni, had been active in constructing and endowing the monastery. See Jean M. Thierry, "Monastères arméniens du Vaspurakan, III," *Revue des études arméniennes*, n.s., 6 (1969): 141-61, and his *Monuments arméniens du Vaspurakan* (Paris: Geuthner, 1989), pp. 132-48.

his nephew Derenik, and his grandson Vest. Another more distant relative Aplgharip (Abul'gharib), son of Prince Hasan and grandson of Khul Khachik of Tornavan, also moved there at some point and was to play an important role later in the century.⁴⁵

Hardly had Davit settled in the region than he became inveigled in the conspiracy of Nikephoros Phokas against Basil II.⁴⁶ However, at a key moment Davit switched sides, for which Basil richly rewarded him with new lands in Caesarea, Tzamandos, and Gabadonia.⁴⁷ This led to more Armenians moving from the south and east of Cappadocia into west Cappadocia, with ensuing confrontations with the local Chalcedonians, in part because the latter had to give up territory to the incomers.⁴⁸ On hearing of the move of Senekerim-Hovhannes, Catholicos Petros I Getadardz, who had been consecrated successor by Catholicos Sargis Sevantsi in 1019 (in what is the first contravention of the established system of election to the office), settled in Sebastia during the period 1023-26, affording the area further legitimacy as a major Armenian center.⁴⁹ Returning to the Bagratuni capital Ani for a year, the catholicos came back on hearing of Senekerim's illness.⁵⁰ Before his death in 1027 the king asked his sons to return the cross to the Monastery of Varag and have him buried there, which they did.⁵¹

Davit inherited Sebastia on his father's death, though not his royal title. Apart from the consecration by Petros in Ani of a new bishop for the diocese in 1028-29,⁵² a pupil of the great polymath Grigor Magistros called Eghishe, there is little information concerning the territory under Davit's rule.⁵³ The Armenian

⁴⁵ Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 137.

⁴⁶ On this incident, see Haïg Berbérian, "Nikefor Fokasi apstambutiune ev Davit Artsruni (1022)" [Nikephoros Phokas' Revolt and Davit Artsruni (1022)], *Handes Amsorya* 81 (1967): cols. 513-20.

⁴⁷ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 96.

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Ibid., p. 274; Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 32.

⁵⁰ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 33.

⁵¹ Ibid. Senekerim was laid to rest in the Church of the Holy Cross at Varag. The traditional Artsruni necropolis was located at the Monastery of the Holy Cross at Soradir (Dzoradir) in the district of Aghbak.

⁵² Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 144.

⁵³ Catholicos Petros had asked Grigor Magistros to send him two of his pupils,

presence in the region became more institutionalized under the supervision of his younger brothers Atom-Ashot and Apusahl, who in 1035 succeeded their older brother, as he had died without leaving a male heir.⁵⁴ In keeping with the historian Matteos Urhayetsi's assessment of Atom-Ashot as "full of virtue and righteousness," he established various Armenian ecclesiastical foundations, primary among which is the Monastery of Surb Nshan (Holy Sign).⁵⁵ As the eleventh-century historian Aristakes Lastiverttsi records, it contained a church dedicated to the Mother of God, which was modeled on Senekerim's church of the same dedication at Varag, designed in a dome-in-square structure like that of Avan and Surb Hripsime in Echmiadzin.⁵⁶ This was to house Varag's rich library and Senekerim-Hovhannes' throne. It also possessed a second church that was devoted to the Holy Cross in the form of a domed basilica, and a third to Surb Hovhannes Karapet (Saint John the Precursor).⁵⁷ The writer

Barsegh and Eghishe. They then pursued their higher education with Petros, who introduced them to the works of Aristotle. When approached by Davit, the catholicos selected Eghishe to fill the vacant see (Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, pp. 34-36). He died in 1064 and was succeeded by Khachatur, who, in turn, officiated for a further thirty-one years (*ibid.*, p. 42). There is a letter in which Grigor discusses his pupils with the catholicos, and a second letter, which he sent his former pupil Eghishe on his consecration. See Grigor Magistros, *Tghtere* [Letters], ed. Kostandin Kostanians (Aleksandrapol: Sanoyants Press, 1910), pp. 15-21, 105-09, 304-05. On Grigor's wide range of intellectual pursuits, see Avedis K. Sanjian, "Gregory Magistros: An Armenian Hellenist," in *TO ELLHNIKON: Studies in Honor of Speros Vryonis, Jr.*, Jelisaveta S. Allen, ed., vol. 2 (New Rochelle, NY: Aristide D. Caratzas, 1993), pp. 111-30.

⁵⁴ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, pp. 97, 274. For the prior death of the fourth brother Kostandin, see Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 37.

⁵⁵ Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, p. 74; Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, p. 55. See Michel Thierry, *Répertoire des monastères arméniens* (Turnhout: Brepols, 1993), p. 75n402. The structure is currently in a reasonable state of preservation but is not accessible as it is located on the grounds of a military installation. For some of the other ecclesiastical foundations attributed to this time period, see Hamazasp Oskian, *Sebastiayi, Kharberdi, Tiarpekiri ev Trapizoni nahangneru vankere* [The Monasteries of the Provinces of Sebastia, Kharpert, Diarbekir, and Trebizond] (Vienna: Mekhitarist Press, 1962), pp. 31, 50.

⁵⁶ Aristakes Lastiverttsi, *Patmutiun* [History], ed. Karen N. Yuzbashian (Erevan: Armenian Academy of Sciences, 1963), p. 82. The structure was renovated in the early twentieth century.

⁵⁷ This church was completely restored in 1857. For a description and ground

Sisianos, born in Sebastia, was associated with this monastery and wrote an encomium on the Forty Martyrs of Sebastia,⁵⁸ a significant example of Armenian literary creativity in the place and time under consideration.⁵⁹

Three years after Atom-Ashot and Apusahl had assumed power, a prince who had relocated from Vaspurakan with Senekerim-Hovhannes now became jealous of Atom-Ashot's holdings and lodged a complaint against him with Emperor Michael IV concerning supposed plans to revolt.⁶⁰ The emperor gave credence to the story and accordingly dispatched troops to Sebastia to summon the brothers to Constantinople. Should they offer any resistance, the imperial force was to engage them in battle. However, the brothers willingly acquiesced and proceeded to the capital where they showed the emperor the rescript of Basil II concerning their lands, which were now in jeopardy. On review, Michael perceived the ruse, sent them back home, and had their adversary incarcerated.⁶¹

The Third Phase of Armenian Immigration

Cappadocia's centrality for the Armenian polity in this period is sealed by the settlement near Caesarea of the royal Bagratuni dynast, King Gagik II of Ani in 1045. Already in the 1020s Basil II had fixed his eyes on the kingdom of Ani, after King Hovhannes-Smbat (1020-40) supported Giorgi I of Georgia against

plan of the various churches in the complex by the then prelate of Sebastia, Bishop Torgom Gushakian, in a letter dated September 13, 1911, to the renowned architect Toramanian, see *Toros Toramanian: Namakner* [Toros Toramanian: Letters], ed. Nina Toramanian (Erevan: Armenian Academy of Sciences, 1968), pp. 180-85. For a description and photograph of the monastery from around the same time, see C. Henry Holbrook, "Impressions of Sivas, 1912," *Journal of Armenian Studies* 5:1 (1990-91): 60-61.

⁵⁸ See *Nerboghian i surb karasunsn* [Encomium of the Holy Forty] (Venice: Mekhitarist Press, 1954), pp. 4-58.

⁵⁹ For a discussion of some luxury manuscripts copied in the region in the period of Catholicos Petros I and Catholicos Khachik II, see Tatiana Ismailova, "Tables des canons de deux manuscrits arméniens du XI^e siècle," *Revue des études arméniennes*, n.s., 3 (1966): 91-117.

⁶⁰ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 274.

⁶¹ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 38.

Byzantium.⁶² Fearing Byzantine revenge, Hovhannes-Smbat became the next to bequeath his kingdom to the empire. For that he received the rank of *magistros* and *archon* of Ani and Greater Armenia until his death in 1041 without an heir. However, the transfer of power was contested by the king's nephew, Gagik, who claimed he was the rightful successor and defeated the Byzantine forces sent to take charge of the property.⁶³ He was then anointed king by Catholicos Petros in 1042 with the support of the *sparapet* (commander-in-chief) Vahram Pahlavuni and tried to hold out in Ani.⁶⁴ But he was soon prevailed upon to go to Constantinople, as a result of which the emperor Constantine IX Monomachos took control of Ani in 1045.⁶⁵ In return, Gagik was offered the region of Melitene, but, on his refusal, was compensated merely by two villages, Kaghaoon Peghat and Pizu, east of Caesarea.⁶⁶ Still, Gagik II was able to extend his estates through marriage with Davit Artsruni's daughter, whose dowry included Caesarea and Tzamandos.⁶⁷

At the same time, the Byzantine governor of Ani dispatched complaints against Catholicos Petros that he wished to rouse the Armenians against Byzantine rule. The governor also planned to remove the seat of the catholicosate from Ani and in 1046 had Petros reside at Artsn.⁶⁸ At the Feast of the Nativity in the following year, the catholicos was taken to the castle of Khaghtoharich, together with his sister's son Khachik, and kept in confinement until Easter.⁶⁹ At the same time, various bishops and fifteen vardapets were summoned, including Archbishop Eghishe of Sebastia.⁷⁰ The historian Hovhannes Sebastatsi records

⁶² Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 96.

⁶³ Ibid.

⁶⁴ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 39.

⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁶⁶ See Vardan Areveltsi, *Patmutiun tiezerakan* [Universal History], ed. Ghevond Alishan (Venice: Mekhitarist Press, 1862), p. 99, and for an English translation, Robert W. Thomson, "The Historical Compilation of Vardan Areveltsi," *Dumbarton Oaks Papers* 43 (1989): 193.

⁶⁷ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 97.

⁶⁸ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 39.

⁶⁹ Ibid., pp. 39-40.

⁷⁰ On the issue of Armeno-Byzantine doctrinal debates in the capital at this time, see Bart'ikian, "Religious Diplomacy," p. 57.

that Constantine Monomachos had Petros sit on a seat of gold.⁷¹ After the audience, Eghishe tried to lift it and, on the emperor's inquiring what he was up to, responded that once the Armenian catholicos had graced it with his presence, it was inappropriate that anyone else should sit on it. Consequently, it was taken to his residence.

On emerging from that ordeal, Petros consecrated Khachik as catholicos at Ani in 1049 and left him in charge there while he was sent to Constantinople a second time, where he remained for three years until 1051.⁷² He was only released after Atom-Ashot Artsruni united his appeals to those of King Gagik II as security for the catholicos and had him brought to Sebastia, since entry to Ani was prohibited. There he built himself a beautifully appointed residence at the Monastery of the Holy Cross, where he spent the last years of his life (1052-58).⁷³ He was buried in a tomb outside the east wall of the sanctuary, which was sealed off for protection.⁷⁴ Among the monastery's other benefactors was Grigor Magistros of the noble Pahlavuni family, who held the position of *dux Mesopotamiae* during the decade 1048-58. He gifted a jewel-encrusted staff, an exquisitely wrought chalice, and a vessel for holy oil and wrote a poem in honor of the Holy Cross.⁷⁵

Catholicos Petros and his successor Khachik II had been called to Constantinople for doctrinal discussions in 1047 in order to remove any religious impediments to Armenian integration into the fabric of Byzantine life, as had already been achieved to a certain degree politically. The Hellenophile tendencies of Petros notwithstanding, he maintained the traditional creed of the Armenian Church and commissioned a refutation of the Chalcedonians by Anania Sanahnetsi in its defense, which built on the traditions

⁷¹ The history of Hovhannes Sebastatsi commences with the eleventh century and continues until the 1830s. For this episode, see Bart'ikian, "Religious Diplomacy," p. 40.

⁷² See Krikor Maksoudian, *Chosen of God: The Election of the Catholicos of All Armenians from the Fourth Century to the Present* (New York: St. Vartan Press, 1995), p. 40.

⁷³ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, pp. 97, 274.

⁷⁴ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 40.

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*

of Anania Narekatsi.⁷⁶ Khachik II, along with several bishops, was again summoned in 1059 by Constantine X Dukas (1059-67) to assent to the Council of Chalcedon. He was also asked to acknowledge the supremacy of the Patriarchate of Constantinople, thus renouncing his autocephaly, in the way the younger generation of Armenian royalty had sacrificed their independence in settling in Cappadocia and perforce accepted the emperor's authority. When the catholicos rejected these conditions, he was held in the imperial capital until 1062, after which he was resettled in the Monastery of Tavblur at Taranta in the Sebastia region (50 miles/80 kilometers northwest of Melitene on the road to Caesarea) until his death in 1065.⁷⁷ After the de facto neutralization of the Armenian catholicosate as a functioning entity during Khachik's enforced exile, the Byzantines took advantage of his death to attempt the complete abolition of the supreme patriarchal see, as had been done in the case of the Syrian Orthodox.⁷⁸ However, this course was counteracted by the cession of the kingdom of Kars to the empire by the principal remaining Bagratuni dynast, Gagik-Abas.⁷⁹

Gagik-Abas was moved by concerns similar to those of his counterparts of Vaspurakan and Ani, in that after sustaining Seljuk attacks on Kars in 1053-54, he had witnessed their capture of Ani in 1064 under Sultan Alp Arslan, who intended to settle

⁷⁶ On this text, see Hakob H. Keoseyian, "Anania Sanahnetsu 'Hakacharutyun' davanabanakan aghbyurnere" [The Doctrinal Sources of Anania Sanahnetsi's "Refutation"], *Ejmiatsin* 38:7 (1981): 49-52; "Anania Sanahnetsu 'Hakacharutyun' patma-mshakutayin nshanakutyune" [The Historical and Cultural Significance of Anania Sanahnetsi's "Refutation"], *Banber Erevani Hamalsarani*, no. 3 (1984): 169-73; "Anania Sanahnetsu 'Hakacharutiune'," [Anania Sanahnetsi's "Refutation"], in *Gandzasar*, no. 1 (1992): 197-203. For the text, see Anania Sanahnetsi, "Ban hakacharutian enddem erkabnakats" [Discourse in Refutation of the Diophysites], in *Gandzasar*, no. 1 (1992): 204-38; no. 2 (1993): 168-218; no. 3 (1994): 174-215.

⁷⁷ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, pp. 97, 117. See also Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, pp. 164-65, and Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, p. 97. In Taranta he was granted two monasteries and a hundred villages. See Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 153.

⁷⁸ For a more detailed treatment of the subject, see Haïg Berbérian, "Hayots katoghikosakan atorin bardzume 11rd darun erkrord kesin" [The Abolition of the Armenian Catholicosate in the Second Half of the Eleventh Century], *Handes Amsorya* 81 (1967): cols. 145-60, 327-46.

⁷⁹ See Maksoudian, *Chosen of God*, p. 41.

the area.⁸⁰ Sebastia had experienced their attack around the Feast of Transfiguration in 1059 under three commanders sent by Tughril Beg on hearing of the weakness of Byzantine fortifications.⁸¹ Since its recapture by Byzantium in 934, Sebastia, like Melitene, had not been provided with defensive walls and hence was devastated by the Turks, the fields being daubed in red, as the historian Hovhannes Sebastatsi records.⁸² The Seljuks plundered the Armenian royal treasury, appropriated women and children as slaves, then set the city on fire, along with palaces, large buildings, and churches, of which Matteos Urhayetsi hyperbolically mentions six hundred.⁸³ The Seljuk army bivouacked there for a week. During the attack Atom-Ashot and Apusahl Artsruni fled with their nobles to the town of Gabadonia for protection, leaving the city without a garrison.⁸⁴

When Gagik-Abas moved from Kars to Cappadocia, he was given lands at the expense of the Armenians already there, receiving Larissa and Gabadonia from the Artsrunis and Caesarea and Tzamandos from Gagik II Bagratuni, in addition to his other possessions, which included Comana Pontica. In 1065, Atom and Apusahl Artsruni went to Constantinople for inconclusive unifica-

⁸⁰ Gagik-Abas' decision left the small Kingdom of Lori-Tashir in the region of Gugark to the north as the only Bagratuni polity, though it, too, had to accept Seljuk suzerainty in 1064 in order to survive. Significantly, the rulers there were also keen to patronize monasteries, of which Haghbat and Sanahin, the necropolis of the dynasty, both founded in the second half of the tenth century, are the best examples. As Lori-Tashir already possessed relative economic stability from its transit trade and enjoyed the privilege, unique among the Bagratuni states, of minting its own coins, the ruling house sought to reinforce its legitimacy even more by installing a local catholicos in its domains. This was in the person of Barsegh Anetsi, nephew of Grigor II who was consecrated in Haghbat under King Kiurike in 1081/82. See Maksoudian, *Chosen of God*, pp. 42-43. For a map of the area at this time, see Richard G. Hovannisian, ed., *The Armenian People from Ancient to Modern Times*, vol. 1: *The Dynastic Periods* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997), p. 45.

⁸¹ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, pp. 41-42; Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 97.

⁸² Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, pp. 41-42.

⁸³ Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, p. 161; Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, p. 95. This may suggest Sebastia's significant but secondary status in comparison with the capital Ani, to which the sum of a thousand and one churches was traditionally ascribed.

⁸⁴ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 275.

tion talks at the invitation of Constantine X Dukas. Gagik II of Ani also joined them in the defense of the Armenian Church's doctrines and practices. Hence, when Grigor II Vkeyaser, son of Grigor Magistros, was elevated to the catholicos throne in the same year, he gave rise to friction with Gagik II by residing in Tzamandos on the territory of Gagik-Abas of Kars (as did his nephew and successor Barsegh Anetsi on Grigor's death in 1105).⁸⁵ In the next decade (1070-78) the area was in the possession of Gagik-Abas' daughter, Mariam Curopalatissa.⁸⁶

The expansion of Armenian settlement in the four Cappadocian themes was itself a source of tension with the Greeks. By this time, the themes of Sebasteia and Lykandos (Lycandus) were fully Armenianized, while in Charsianon this was restricted to the region of Caesarea, and in Cappadocia to the region of Gabadonia. Indeed, many frescoes in caves in the Cappadocian area betray Armenian influence. A particular bone of contention arose between Markos, Metropolitan of Caesarea, and Gagik II over the hierarch's dog. As told by Matteos Urhayetsi, Gagik paid the prelate a visit one day and insisted that he beckon the animal. Though he protested for a while, finally he called it by its name Armen. Gagik in turn was so furious at this that he had both put in a sack until the dog bit his master to death.⁸⁷ Needless to say, this incident further exacerbated the strained relations between Greeks and Armenians in the area.

Romanos IV Diogenes succeeded in 1068/69 in expelling the Seljuks from the region, but in the following year they defeated and captured his general, Manuel Curopalates, and took advantage of the situation to attack the Armenians in the Sebastia region

⁸⁵ Ibid., pp. 97-98.

⁸⁶ For the interpretation of the famous manuscript portrait in which Mariam is depicted seated in the center of a composition between her father Gagik-Abas and her mother Gorandukht as her official designation as her father's heir, see Thomas F. Mathews and Anna C. Daskalakis, "The Portrait of Princess Marem of Kars, Jerusalem 2556, fol. 135b," in *From Byzantium to Iran: Armenian Studies in Honour of Nina G. Garsoïan*, Jean-Pierre Mahé and Robert W. Thomson, eds. (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1996), p. 480. For Mariam's relations with the Empress Eudocia, see Hrachia Acharian, *Hayots andznanneri bararan* [Armenian Dictionary of Proper Names], vol. 3 (Beirut: Sevan Press, 1972), p. 253.

⁸⁷ Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, pp. 217-20; Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, pp. 121-22.

again. Moreover, when Romanos took the field against the Seljuks in 1071, he had to pass through Sebastia. On that occasion Atom-Ashot bestowed many gifts on him, but the Byzantine princes of the environs maligned the Armenians to the effect that they were inciting the Seljuks to attack.⁸⁸ The emperor considered the charges as genuine and allowed his troops to plunder Sebastia. Though various Greeks and Armenians of the district implored him to reconsider, Romanos removed Atom-Ashot and Apusahl from office and threatened he would compel the brothers and their people to become Chalcedonians on his return.⁸⁹ However, the emperor was captured by Alp Arslan at the decisive battle of Manzikert (Manazkert), which spelled the end of Byzantine power in eastern Anatolia as a whole.

As the 880s had signaled a major expansion of Armenian immigration into the area around Sebastia, so events of the 1070s and 1080s marked a significant decline in its regional importance. The Armenian monarchs who had added such luster to the territory, Senekerim-Hovhannes of Vaspurakan and Gagik-Abas of Kars, passed away in 1027 and 1081, respectively, followed by their heirs in quick succession. Freed from Byzantine suzerainty in 1074,⁹⁰ Senekerim's grandsons Atom-Ashot and Apusahl continued to govern in Sebastia until their death in 1080, after which their line largely disappears from the historical record.⁹¹ Meanwhile, Gagik II of Ani was killed in a feud with the three sons of the Byzantine nobleman Pantaleon (Mantale), as recorded by Urhayetsi, in Kyzistra in 1073, despite the intervention of Atom and Apusahl Artsruni and Gagik-Abas of Kars along with Gagik II's elder son Hovhannes.⁹² His body was later returned to his monastery in Pizu for burial. The murder was avenged in 1111-12 by the Rubenian prince Toros, who claimed descent from one of Gagik's

⁸⁸ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, pp. 100, 275.

⁸⁹ Maksoudian, *Chosen of God*, p. 41.

⁹⁰ Hild and Restle, *Kappadokien*, p. 275.

⁹¹ Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 44.

⁹² For an account of Gagik II's death, see Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, pp. 263-65, and Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, pp. 144-45. For 1073 as the date of Gagik's death rather than 1079/80 as recorded by Urhayetsi, see Gérard Dédéyan, *Histoire des arméniens* (Toulouse: Editions Privat, 1982), p. 308.

generals.⁹³ Meanwhile, Gagik's son Hovhannes had married the daughter of the Byzantine Dux of Ani in hopes of furthering his ancestral claim to the city, but on being disappointed in that aspiration, moved first to Georgia and then to Constantinople, where he died soon after his son Ashot, who had been poisoned. This was also the fate of Gagik's younger son Davit, who was killed by his father-in-law for suspected treachery, bringing the line to an end.⁹⁴

The death of Davit occurred significantly, not in Cappadocia but in Cilicia to the south, where the Armenian center of gravity was already relocating and whose principalities were being formed as the nucleus of a new state.⁹⁵ The final Seljuk conquest of Sebastia took place in the years 1085-92, after which the Danishmendids seized power and ruled until 1173.⁹⁶ In that year the city passed to the administration of the sultan of Konia, under whom, during the first half of the following century, the local Armenian bishop Anania became an anti-catholicos with jurisdiction over all the Armenians within that state.⁹⁷

The liberation of Tarsus, then de facto capital of Cilicia, from the Hamdanids by Nikephoros Phokas in 965 and the withdrawal

⁹³ See Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, pp. 396-400, and Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, pp. 207-09.

⁹⁴ See Acharian, *Hayots andznanneri bararan*, vol. 1, p. 22, and the sources cited there.

⁹⁵ For a detailed treatment of the transition in Armenian power politics, see Gérard Dédéyan, "Les pouvoirs arméniens dans le Proche-Orient méditerranéen (1068-1144)" (doctoral thesis, Université de Paris 1, 1990). For the significant contemporary community of Armenians in Egypt and Catholicos Grigor II's concern for their temporal and religious well-being, see Angèle Kapoïan-Kouymjian, *L'Égypte vue par des arméniens* (Paris: Fondation Singer-Polignac, 1988), pp. 7-24, and Dadoyan, *Fatimid Armenians*, pp. 85-105.

⁹⁶ For Sebastia in this period, see Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, pp. 170-72. In the post-Byzantine era, there was an orderly succession of Armenian prelates in the see (ibid., pp. 168-69). On occasion, though, the effects of religious persecution were felt, as in the martyrdom in 1156 of the four younger children of the Armenian prince Davit, who nevertheless apostasized to Islam with his eldest son Arev. See Hovhannes Sebastatsi, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 44.

⁹⁷ On the bishop and the circumstances surrounding his elevation, see Haïg Berberian, "Le patriarcat arménien du sultanat de Roum: L'anti-catholicos Anania," *Revue des études arméniennes*, n.s., 3 (1966): 233-43. On the earlier recognition, which Catholicos Barsegh Anetsi had received from Malik Shah, sultan of Nicaea, see Maksoudian, *Chosen of God*, p. 43.

of much of the Arab population opened up the territory for Armenian immigration in the next few decades under Basil II.⁹⁸ Although their settlement is not nearly as well documented as that of Cappadocia, it is clear that by the time of the Seljuk incursion of 1069, Armenians were already quite well established within the population of the Cilician plain.⁹⁹ This therefore necessitated the creation of an Armenian see at Tarsus during the catholicosate of Khachik I.¹⁰⁰ Various Armenians are known to have served there in an official capacity, usually after having been integrated into Chalcedonian Orthodoxy. Vasak, son of Grigor Magistros, was designated Dux of Antioch for a time, as was Chatatourios (Khachatur Shirakuni), who rescued Edessa twice from Seljuk attack in the 1060s.¹⁰¹ Later, in the early years of the next century, there was a certain Aspietes (Aspet) sent to Cilicia by Alexios I Comnenos.¹⁰²

One of the earliest figures to receive a commission in the area, however, was Aplgharip Artsruni, who was among the relatives of Senekerim-Hovhannes Artsruni to relocate to Sebastia from Vaspurakan.¹⁰³ He was assigned as *strategos* of Tarsus and Mopsuestia by the emperor Michael VII in 1072, who had recently been elevated to the throne in Constantinople in the aftermath of Romanos' shocking debacle at Manzikert.¹⁰⁴ In his official

⁹⁸ Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, p. 63.

⁹⁹ Ibid., p. 432.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., p. 61.

¹⁰¹ See Agheksandrian, *Patmutiun Sebastioy*, p. 155. As this source records, Khachatur died in 1076 at the hands of his Byzantine confessor who choked him while asleep in his castle of Andrion. Vasak Pahlavuni was also killed treacherously in the following year.

¹⁰² Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, p. 67. See also Acharian, *Hayots andznanneri bararan*, vol. 1, p. 231.

¹⁰³ It has been implied that Aplgharip was already *strategos* of Seleucia in mid-century on the basis of a seal that bears the inscription "Ἀρσacidης Ἀπελγαρίφης." See Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, p. 64n362. However, the epithet Arsacid, which is employed, was more characteristic of the usage of the Pahlavuni family. Consequently, the owner may have been the Aplgharip Pahlavuni who was responsible for constructing the Church of the Holy Savior at Ani in 1036 and left several other inscriptions in the city. See Acharian, *Hayots andznanneri bararan*, vol. 1, pp. 21-22.

¹⁰⁴ The date of 1042, which has gained a certain currency with regard to Aplgharip's appointment, has been applied in error as a result of confusion with an

capacity Aplgharip also held possession of Sis, Adana, Lambron, and Paperon.¹⁰⁵ Building up the castle of Lambron,¹⁰⁶ he made Paperon his administrative seat, erecting there a large church with a family mausoleum where he was laid to rest in 1080.¹⁰⁷ Despite his career as a Byzantine official, Aplgharip assiduously maintained his ties with the Armenian aristocracy. In this connection he allied himself with Gagik II by arranging the marriage of his daughter to the king's younger son, Davit Bagratuni. Indeed, it was the growth of tensions between father and son-in-law that provoked King Gagik to embark on his fateful journey to Cilicia in 1073, which precipitated his death.¹⁰⁸ Thereafter, it appears, according to some traditions, that Aplgharip married his daughter to Oshin, son of Hetum of the house of Zaven Pahlavuni who had relocated to Cilicia from his lands at Mayrats-Dzurk near Ganja (Gandzak), along with his brothers Halkam and Bazuni.¹⁰⁹ On Oshin's marriage in about 1073, Aplgharip is then to have granted the district of Lambron as a dowry to Oshin. Records of the First Crusade suggest that Oshin later recaptured Adana from the Seljuk expedition of 1085 and

unrelated event connected with his father. See Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, p. 63; Matteos Urhayetsi, *Patmutiun*, pp. 105-08; Dostourian, *Armenia and the Crusades*, pp. 69-70.

¹⁰⁵ Aleksandr Kazhdan, *Armiane v sostave gospodstvuiushchego klassa Vizantijskoj imperii v XI-XII vv.* [Armenians in the Structure of the Ruling Class of the Byzantine Empire in the 11th-12th Centuries] (Erevan: Armenian Academy of Sciences, 1975), pp. 33-36.

¹⁰⁶ It has been argued that the employment of smoothly faced stones in the construction of this fortress in contrast to the rough hewn stones normal in other Cilician castles is an intentional allusion to the walls of Ani. See Robert Edwards, *The Fortification of Armenian Cilicia* (Washington, DC: Dumbarton Oaks, 1987), p. 182, and for further treatment of the subject, Alice Taylor, "The Walls of Ani: Sign as Function," in *Ani: World Architectural Heritage of a Medieval Armenian Capital*, ed. S. Peter Cowe (Leuven and Paris: Peeters, 2002), pp. 69-76.

¹⁰⁷ See the information provided in Samvel Vardapet's biography of Nerses Lambronatsi, archbishop of Tarsus in the second half of the twelfth century, which is published from a manuscript of 1712 in Coadjutor Catholicos Babgen [Kiuleserian], *Tsutsak dzeragrats Ghalatroy azgayin matenadarani Hayots* [Catalogue of the Manuscripts in the Armenian National Library of Galata] (Antelias: Catholicosate of Cilicia, 1961), cols. 448-49.

¹⁰⁸ Aplgharip had confined Davit in his fortress at Paperon, from which Gagik extricated him. See Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, p. 64.

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 65. According to the account of Samvel Anetsi (Samuel of Ani), Oshin seized the castle from the Seljuks.

called on one of the Western commanders, Tankred, to assist in repossessing Mamistra from Turkish control.¹¹⁰ Moreover, his father-in-law Aplgharip was sufficiently established that Gevorg Loretsi moved to Tarsus in 1072 after a dispute with Catholicos Grigor V kayaser (who had consecrated him to share the catholicosol dignity) and resided at the Monastery of Drazark near Sis until his death in 1085.¹¹¹

Though Oshin's significance as the originator of what was to become the Hetumian (Hetumid) house, second in status after the Rubenians, would ultimately be greater,¹¹² the key Armenian figure in this period of transition from Cappadocia to Cilicia was another Byzantine Chalcedonian official Philaretos Brachamios (Vahram).¹¹³ The latter created a mercurial fiefdom (1073-1115), which, at its apogee in 1078, encompassed most of the territory from the Mediterranean littoral as far as Melitene.¹¹⁴ Appointed *strategos autokrator* by Romanos IV at Romanupolis in 1069, Philaretos joined with the official Khachatur in loyally protecting his master in his discomfiture after Manzikert and refused to acknowledge the sovereignty of Romanos' successor, Michael VII Dukas, who had his rival blinded thereafter and confined to a monastery.¹¹⁵ Pulling back to Germanikeia (Marash), Philaretos gathered an army of his own and set about the conquest of the area in the name of the old emperor in concert with Baron Ruben, proceeding down the eastern and western valleys of the River Saros from Cappadocia to Cilicia.¹¹⁶

¹¹⁰ Ibid., p. 66. One of the last records of Oshin is his appearance at Antioch in 1111 as Tankred's vassal (ibid., p. 67).

¹¹¹ See Maksoudian, *Chosen of God*, p. 42.

¹¹² Wipertus-Hugo Rüdert-Collenberg, *The Rupenides, Hethumides and Lusignans: The Structure of the Armeno-Cilician Dynasties* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1963), p. 16.

¹¹³ For an overview of Philaretos' career, see Colin J. Yarnley, "Philaretos: Armenian Bandit or Byzantine General?" *Revue des études arméniennes*, n.s., 9 (1972): 331-53.

¹¹⁴ Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, p. 64. In that year, under the new emperor Nikephoros III, Philaretos was recognized as *Curopolates*, *Domestikos* of the East, and *Dux* of Antioch.

¹¹⁵ Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 206.

¹¹⁶ Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, p. 65. In this endeavor Philaretos employed Armenian outlaws who had been resisting the central government since about 1065 and are cited in Syriac sources as causing much havoc in the region. See Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," pp. 193, 195. For a useful map of the

Desiring legitimacy for his rule and currying the favor of the majority of Armenians in the area, who maintained their ancestral creed, Philaretos invited Grigor II V kayaser to move the see to his territory. When this failed, at the catholicos' suggestion, he approached Sargis, nephew of Petros I, in 1076, who agreed to settle in Chonion (Honi, 12 kilometers/7.5 miles northwest of Arabissos) in southern Cappadocia as hierarch.¹¹⁷ Showing the same concern to the West Syrians, who were also numerous in the region, Philaretos also elevated Archimandrite Markos of the Barid monastery as anti-patriarch in 1088 and had him reside in the Zarnucha monastery southwest of Melitene until his death in 1090.¹¹⁸ The friction caused by such close relations between Armenians and Syrians in this time and place led to a renewal of religious polemic.¹¹⁹

Meanwhile, Baron Ruben seized the castle of Kopitar (Gubidara) in 1073, thereafter extending his holdings to include Bardzrberd. This expansion was continued by his son Kostandin, who captured Vahka in 1097 and, in recognition of his growing independence from Byzantium, was accorded by the Crusaders the titles of count

area under discussion, which also displays the territories held by some of the other Armenian princes, see Claude Mutaſian, *Le royaume arménien de Cilicie XII^e-XIV^e siècle* (Paris: CNRS Editions, 1993), p. 18.

¹¹⁷ Sargis, in turn, appointed a successor Teodoros, who acceded to the office on his predecessor's death in the following year. The issue of legitimacy is such that when Honi passed from Philaretos' domains to the Seljuks in 1085 and Teodoros refused to move his see, Philaretos orchestrated the installation of a new catholicos, Poghos Varagtsi, in his capital. See Maksoudian, *Chosen of God*, p. 42.

¹¹⁸ On the syncretistic character of Philaretos' fiefdom, see Dadoyan, *Fatimid Armenians*, pp. 75-80.

¹¹⁹ In this regard there is the anti-Armenian tract composed by the West Syrian Patriarch Yovhannan Barshushan (1064-circa 1073). See Anton Baumstark, *Geschichte der syrischen Literatur* (Bonn: Webers Verlag, 1922), p. 292. See also the response by Gevorg Loretsi in Pogharian, ed., *Girk tghtots*, pp. 624-56, as well as the earlier correspondence between a previous Syrian Patriarch and Grigor Magistros (*Tghtere*, pp. 148-64). Despite their fundamentally liturgical differences, Grigor had agreed to intercede with the emperor for the reestablishment of the Syrian Patriarchate on Byzantine territory. Similarly, Byzantine anti-Armenian religious polemic, which had begun locally in Sebastia about a century earlier, continued under Alexios I Comnenos (Alexius Comnenus). Two of the most important polemics of this era were Euthymios Zigabenos' *Doctrinal Panoply*, about which see Kazhdan and Epstein, *Change in Byzantine Culture*, p. 163, and the more voluminous treatise of Nicetas Stethatos. See Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 214.

and marquis.¹²⁰ It then fell to his son Toros to begin the dynasty's descent toward the Cilician plain by securing from the Seljuks the strategic site of Anazarba in the lower hill country in 1111.¹²¹

Conclusion

The struggles the Rubenians had to engage in with other Armenian dynasts, with Byzantium, and with the Seljuks, their northern neighbors, for hegemony over the region belong to another chapter of Armenian history. At this point, some of the more important issues to emerge from this discussion of the Armenian interlude in Cappadocia between the decline of the caliphate and the rise of the Seljuks should be underlined. The renewed proximity of "Greeks," Syrians, and Armenians in the swathe of territory from Melitene to Sebastia gave rise to various results, significant examples of cultural exchange, as well as manifestations of ethnic and religious hostility. Another factor that influenced these developments is clearly the disjunction between the situation in Constantinople, the capital, and that on the ground in those eastern provinces. The growth of the Armenian population in the region, hastened by the increasing Seljuk menace, afforded them majority status in certain areas, which proved disquieting for representatives of the Byzantine mainstream that had traditionally borne the stamp of confessional orthodoxy. The creation of parallel "monophysite" jurisdictions and hierarchy on that scale, which acquired a degree of official toleration for a while, raised afresh the question of what it meant to be "Roman."¹²²

At the same time, symbiosis was complicated by the fact that the primary Armenian leaders were sovereign monarchs who had ceded their ancestral lands to the Byzantine Empire by negotiation, not as a result of military capitulation, and relocated into their new lands with their entourage and an appreciable cross-section of their population. Hence, they transported into this space much of their lifestyle, which was at odds with the surrounding social and administrative structures. In contrast, Armenian aristocrats who entered the Byzantine civil service generally had

¹²⁰ Hild and Hellenkemper, *Kilikien und Isaurien*, pp. 65-66.

¹²¹ *Ibid.*, p. 68.

¹²² Dagron, "Minorités ethniques," p. 212.

to adopt the Chalcedonian creed. This, however, was not always sufficient to endear them to their coreligionist subjects and counterparts because of tensions against their ethnic identity as Armenians. At the same time, those officials' rejection of their ancestral creed often had the effect of fomenting enmity against them among the Armenian and Syrian populations under their command. Nevertheless, the demographic importance of the Armenian and Syrian communities for the Byzantine military became a further factor in counseling toleration of diverse creeds in the interests of internal security and the goal of re-conquest, which were so characteristic of the Macedonian dynasty.¹²³ Under the exacerbating pressures of the Seljuk advance, the tenuous *modus vivendi* inevitably began to unravel, prompting Armenian officials to seize the opportunity to cross the Taurus range in search of greater protection and independence.

¹²³ *Ibid.*, p. 204.